

General Purpose Standing Committee No 3

Budget Estimates 2011-2012

Ordered to be printed 9 December 2011 according to Standing Order 231.

New South Wales Parliamentary Library cataloguing-in-publication data:

New South Wales. Parliament. Legislative Council. General Purpose Standing Committee No. 3

Budget estimates, 2011-2012 / General Purpose Standing Committee No. 3. [Sydney, N.S.W.] : the Committee, 2012. – viii, 23 p. ; 30 cm. (Report ; no. 25)

Chair: Natasha Maclaren-Jones MLC.
“February 2012”.

ISBN 9781921286742

1. New South Wales. Parliament. Legislative Council. General Purpose Standing Committee No. 3—
Appropriations and expenditures.
 - I. Title.
 - II. Maclaren-Jones, Natasha.
 - III. Series: New South Wales. Parliament. Legislative Council. General Purpose Standing Committee No. 3.
Report ; no. 25

DDC 328.94407

How to contact the Committee

Members of the General Purpose Standing Committee No 3 can be contacted through the Committee Secretariat. Written correspondence and enquiries should be directed to:

The Director

General Purpose Standing Committee No 3

Legislative Council

Parliament House, Macquarie Street

Sydney New South Wales 2000

Internet www.parliament.nsw.gov.au/gpscno3

Email gpscno3@parliament.nsw.gov.au

Telephone 02 9230 3509

Facsimile 02 9230 2981

Terms of reference

1. That upon tabling, the Budget Estimates and related papers for the financial year 2011-2012 presenting the amounts to be appropriated from the Consolidated Fund be referred to the General Purpose Standing Committees for inquiry and report.

2. That the initial hearings be scheduled as follows:

Day One: Monday 24 October 2011

GPSC1	Finance and Services, the Illawarra	9.00 am – 1.00 pm
GPSC2	Ageing, Disability Services	9.00 am – 11.00 am
GPSC2	Education	11.10 am – 1.45 pm
GPSC5	Primary Industries, Small Business	11.15 am – 1.00 pm
GPSC1	Trade and Investment	2.00 pm – 3.30 pm
GPSC2	Health, Medical Research	2.00 pm – 6.00 pm
GPSC1	Planning and Infrastructure	3.45 pm – 6.00 pm

Day Two: Tuesday 25 October 2011

GPSC1	Treasury	9.00 am – 1.00 pm
GPSC3	Regional Infrastructure and Services	9.00 am – 11.00 am
GPSC3	The Legislature	11.15 am – 12.00 pm
GPSC3	Special Minister of State, the Central Coast	12.15 pm – 1.00 pm
GPSC1	Premier, Western Sydney	2.00 pm – 6.00 pm
GPSC3	Transport	2.00 pm – 6.00 pm

Day Three: Wednesday 26 October 2011

GPSC2	Mental Health, Healthy Lifestyles, Western NSW	9.00am – 10.15am
GPSC2	Citizenship and Communities, Aboriginal Affairs	10.30 am – 12.00 pm
GPSC2	Sport and Recreation	12.15 pm – 1.00 pm
GPSC2	Education	2.00 pm – 6.00 pm
GPSC4	Attorney General, Justice	2.00 pm – 6.00 pm

Day Four: Thursday 27 October 2011

GPSC5	Environment, Heritage	9.00 am – 1.00 pm
GPSC4	Police and Emergency Services, the Hunter	2.00 pm – 6.00 pm
GPSC5	Local Government, the North Coast	2.00 pm – 3.30 pm
GPSC5	Fair Trading	3.45 pm – 5.45 pm

Day Five: Friday 28 October 2011

GPSC5	Resources and Energy	9.00 am – 1.00 pm
GPSC3	Tourism, Major Events, Hospitality and Racing, Arts	9.00 am – 1.00 pm
GPSC2	Family and Community Services, Women	2.00 pm – 4.30 pm
GPSC3	Roads and Ports	2.00 pm – 6.00 pm

3. That an initial round of supplementary hearings be scheduled as follows:

Day One: Monday 28 November 2011

GPSC 1
GPSC 2

Day Two: Tuesday 29 November 2011

GPSC 1
GPSC 3

Day Three: Wednesday 30 November 2011

GPSC 4
GPSC 2

Day Four: Thursday 1 December 2011

GPSC 4
GPSC 5

Day Five: Friday 2 December 2011

GPSC 5
GPSC 3

4. That each scheduled day for the initial round of hearings will begin at 9:00 am and conclude by 6:00 pm.
5. The committees must hear evidence in public.
6. The committees may ask for explanations from Ministers in the House, or officers of departments, statutory bodies or corporations, relating to the items of proposed expenditure.
7. There is no provision under this resolution for a Minister or officer of a Department to make an opening statement before the committee commences questions.
8. A daily Hansard record is to be published as soon as practicable after each day's proceedings.
9. The committees are to present a final report to the House by the last sitting day of the first sitting week in February 2012.
10. Members may lodge questions on notice with the Clerk to the committee during a Budget Estimates hearing and up to two days following.
11. All answers to questions taken on notice during the hearing, and questions on notice lodged up to two days following the hearing, must be provided within 21 days, or as otherwise determined by the committee.

The terms of reference were referred to the Committee by the House on 12 May 2011, see *LC Minutes* (12/05/2011) 102-103, Item 7; as amended by *LC Minutes* (24/08/2011) 362-363, Item 8; as amended by *LC Minutes* (12/10/2011) 476, Item 3; as amended by *LC Minutes* (21/10/2011) 547, Item 4.

Committee membership

The Hon Natasha Maclaren-Jones MLC	Liberal Party	<i>(Chair)</i>
The Hon Niall Blair MLC	The Nationals	<i>(Deputy Chair)</i>
The Hon John Ajaka MLC	Liberal Party	
The Hon Cate Faehrmann MLC	The Greens	
The Hon Penny Sharpe MLC	Australian Labor Party	
The Hon Paul Green MLC	Christian Democratic Party	
The Hon Mick Veitch MLC	Australian Labor Party	

Non-substantive members who attended the hearings

The Hon Jan Barham MLC	The Greens
The Hon Jeremy Buckingham MLC	The Greens
The Hon Greg Donnelly MLC	Australian Labor Party
The Hon Amanda Fazio MLC	Australian Labor Party
The Hon Luke Foley MLC	Australian Labor Party
Dr John Kaye MLC	The Greens
The Hon Charlie Lynn MLC	Liberal Party
The Hon Peter Primrose MLC	Australian Labor Party
The Hon Penny Sharpe MLC	Australian Labor Party
Mr David Shoebridge MLC	The Greens
The Hon Lynda Voltz MLC	Australian Labor Party
The Hon Steve Whan MLC	Australian Labor Party

Table of contents

	Chair's foreword	viii
Chapter 1	Introduction	1
	Referral of the 2011-2012 Budget Estimates	1
	Hearings	1
	Transcripts	1
	Questions on notice	1
Chapter 2	Issues raised during hearings	3
	Regional Infrastructure and Services	3
	The Legislature	3
	Special Minister of State, the Central Coast	4
	Transport	4
	Tourism, Major Events, Hospitality and Racing, Arts	4
	Roads and Ports	5
Appendix 1	Witnesses	7
Appendix 2	Minutes	9
Appendix 3	Dissenting statement	23

Chair's foreword

I am pleased to present the report of General Purpose Standing Committee No. 3 on the 2011-2012 Budget Estimates. During the initial round of hearings the Committee held six public hearings, receiving 14 hours of evidence to examine the portfolio areas of:

- Regional Infrastructure and Services
- The Legislature
- Special Minister of State, the Central Coast
- Transport
- Tourism, Major Events, Hospitality and Racing, Arts
- Roads and Ports.

The Committee subsequently resolved that members should submit any supplementary questions on notice to witnesses. On behalf of the Committee, I would like to thank the Ministers and their witnesses who gave evidence during the Inquiry.



The Hon Natasha Maclaren-Jones MLC

Chair

Chapter 1 Introduction

Referral of the 2011-2012 Budget Estimates

- 1.1 On 12 May 2011, the Legislative Council resolved that ‘the Budget Estimates and related papers for the financial year 2011-2012 presenting the amounts to be appropriated from the Consolidated Fund be referred to the General Purpose Standing Committees for inquiry and report’.¹
- 1.2 Each Committee was to examine the Budget Estimates for the relevant portfolios and report to the House by the last sitting day of the first sitting week in February 2012.

Hearings

- 1.3 The Committee held six public hearings as follows:
- Tuesday 25 October 2011 – Regional Infrastructure and Services
 - Tuesday 25 October 2011 – The Legislature
 - Tuesday 25 October 2011 – Special Minister of State, the Central Coast
 - Tuesday 25 October 2011 – Transport
 - Friday 28 October 2011 – Tourism, Major Events, Hospitality and Racing, Arts
 - Friday 28 October 2011 – Roads and Ports
- 1.4 A brief summary of the key issues raised during the hearings is contained in Chapter 2.

Transcripts

- 1.5 Transcripts of the hearings are available on the Committee's web page at www.parliament.nsw.gov.au/gpsc3

Questions on notice

- 1.6 Questions taken on notice, and the answers to these questions, are also available on the Committee's web page.

¹ *LC Minutes* (12/05/2011) 102-103, Item 7; as amended by *LC Minutes* (24/08/2011) 362-363, Item 8; as amended by *LC Minutes* (12/10/2011) 476, Item 3; as amended by *LC Minutes* (21/10/2011) 547, Item 4.

Chapter 2 Issues raised during hearings

This chapter provides a brief summary by portfolio of the key issues raised the hearings.

Regional Infrastructure and Services

2.1 A hearing examining the portfolio of Regional Infrastructure and Services was held on Tuesday 25 October 2011. The following issues were raised:

- Solar Bonus Scheme
- The ‘Resources for the Regions’ fund
- Regional Relocation Grants
- Measures to improve infrastructure and services in regional NSW
- The ‘decade of decentralisation’
- Issues facing cross-border communities
- Petition from the Orange community for a 24-hour helicopter emergency retrieval service
- National Broadband Network.

The Legislature

2.2 A hearing examining the portfolio of the Legislature was held on Tuesday 25 October 2011. The following issues were raised:

- Parliamentary Budget Officer
- The Parliament’s acquisitive art prizes
- Replacement of analogue televisions in members’ offices
- Financial impact of the four day sitting calendar
- Replacement of the Chamber broadcasting system
- The status of water recycling and solar panel use in Parliament House
- The Twinning Program with the Solomon Islands and Bougainville Parliaments.

Special Minister of State, the Central Coast

2.3 A hearing examining the portfolios of Special Minister of State, the Central Coast was held on Tuesday 25 October 2011. The following issues were raised:

- Wallarah 2 Coal Project and coal mining in the Central Coast water catchment area
- Duties of the Special Minister of State
- Maternity ward at Wyong Hospital
- Central Coast Conservation Plan and North Gosford Structure Plan
- The Gosford Public School site
- The Central Coast Water Corporation
- Hunting in the Olney State Forest
- Woy Woy Rehabilitation Centre
- Wyong Police Station
- Kincumber Fire Station.

Transport

2.4 A hearing examining the portfolio of Transport was held on Tuesday 25 October 2011. The following issues were raised:

- Modelling of the Northwest Rail Line
- Transport Masterplan
- Greenway construction costs
- Relationship between Infrastructure NSW and other government agencies
- Transport for NSW Freight Strategy
- Ferry services
- XPT options
- Real time travelling information for private bus customers.

Tourism, Major Events, Hospitality and Racing, Arts

2.5 A hearing examining the portfolios of Tourism, Major Events, Hospitality and Racing, Arts was held on Friday 28 October 2011. The following issues were raised:

- The White Bay cruise terminal
- Status of the Aboriginal Tourism Action Plan
- Development of a New South Wales arts and culture policy

- Funding for public library services
- Bids for major events
- A new Exhibition and Convention Centre in Darling Harbour
- Appointments to the Casino, Liquor and Gaming Control Advisory Board
- The impact of proposed Federal legislation regarding mandatory pre-commitment for the use of poker machines
- Billboard and outdoor advertising at sporting venues
- Measures to ensure the viability of the registered clubs movement in New South Wales

Roads and Ports

2.6 A Hearing examining the portfolios of Roads and Ports was held on Friday 28 October 2011. The following issues were raised:

- M5 widening and tunnels
- Road maintenance contestability
- Cycleways
- Newell highway
- School zones
- Port Botany Landside Improvement Strategy.

Appendix 1 Witnesses

1. Regional Infrastructure and Services – Monday 25 October 2011

Name	Position and Organisation
The Hon Andrew Stoner MP	Deputy Premier, Minister for Trade and Investment, and Minister for Regional Infrastructure and Services
Mr Mark Paterson AO	Director General, Department of Trade and Investment, Regional Infrastructure and Services
Mr Barry Buffier	Deputy Director General, Department of Trade and Investment, Regional Infrastructure and Services
Mr Michael Cullen	Executive Director, Enterprise, Small Business and Regional Development

2. The Legislature– Monday 25 October 2011

Name	Position and Organisation
The Hon Don Harwin MLC	President of the Legislative Council of NSW
Mr David Blunt	Clerk of the Parliaments, NSW Legislative Council
Mr Robert Stefanic	Executive Manager, Department of Parliamentary Services
Mr Kim Smith	Director of Finance, Department of Parliamentary Services

3. Special Minister of State , the Central Coast – Monday 25 October 2011

Name	Position and Organisation
The Hon Chris Hartcher MP	Minister for Resources and Energy, Special Minister of State, and Minister for the Central Coast

4. Transport– Monday 25 October 2011

Name	Position and Organisation
The Hon Gladys Berejiklian MP	Minister for Transport
Mr Les Wielinga	Director General, Transport NSW
Mr Chris Lock	Deputy Director, Transport Construction Authority
Mr Rob Mason	Chief Executive, RailCorp
Mr Peter Rowley	Chief Executive, State Transit Authority
Mr David Callahan	Chief Executive, Sydney Ferries

5. Tourism, Major Events, Hospitality and Racing, Arts—Friday 28 October 2011

Name	Position and Organisation
The Hon George Souris MP	Minister for Tourism, Major Events, Hospitality and Racing, and Minister for the Arts
Mr Mark Paterson AO	Director General, Department of Trade and Investment, Regional Infrastructure and Services
Mr Barry Buffier	Deputy Director General, Department of Trade and Investment, Regional Infrastructure and Services
Ms Sandra Chipchase	Chief Executive Officer, Destination NSW
Ms Elizabeth Tydd	Executive Director, Office of Liquor, Gaming and Racing, Department of Trade and Investment, Regional Infrastructure and services
Ms Mary Darwell	Executive Director, Arts NSW, Department of Trade and Investment, Regional Infrastructure and Services

6. Roads and Ports— Friday 28 October 2011

Name	Position and Organisation
The Hon Duncan Gay MLC	Ministers for Roads and Ports
Mr Les Wielinga	Director General of Transport
Mr Paul Hesford	Director, Finance and Corporate Services, Roads and Traffic Authority, Department of Transport
Ms Ann King	Deputy Chief Executive Officer and Director, Customer Services, Roads and Traffic Authority, Department of Transport
Mr Peter Wells	Director, Regulatory Services, Roads and Traffic Authority, Department of Transport
Mr Geoff Fogarty	Director, Infrastructure Services, Roads and Traffic Authority, Department of Transport
Mr Michael Veysey	Director, Network Services, Roads and Traffic Authority, Department of Transport
Mr Soames Job	Director, Centre for Road Safety, Roads and Traffic Authority, Department of Transport
Mr Tony Middleton	Deputy Chief Executive, NSW Maritime, Department of Transport
Mr Grant Gilfillan	Chief Executive Officer, Sydney Ports Corporation, Department of Transport
Mr Dom Figliomeni	Chief Executive Officer, Port Kembla Port Corporation, Department of Transport

Appendix 2 Minutes

Minutes No. 3

Thursday 20 October 2011

General Purpose Standing Committee No. 3

Members Lounge, Parliament House, Sydney, at 1.03pm

1. Members present

Mrs Maclaren-Jones (*Chair*)

Mr Blair (*Deputy Chair*)

Mr Ajaka

Ms Faehrmann

Ms Sharpe

Mr Veitch

Mr Green

2. Confirmation of previous minutes

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Ajaka: That draft Minutes No. 2 be confirmed.

3. ***

4. Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2011-2012 - procedural resolutions

4.1 Allocation of question time

Resolved, on the motion of Ms Sharpe: That for the initial round of hearings into the Budget Estimates 2011-2012, the sequence of questions to be asked alternate between Opposition, Cross Bench and Government members, in that order, with 20 minutes allocated to each.

4.2 Publication of answers to questions on notice

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Green: That the Committee authorises the Clerk of the Committee to publish the answers provided to questions on notice, except those answers for which confidentiality is requested, after these answers have been circulated to Committee members.

4.3 Order for examination of portfolios

Resolved, on the motion of Ms Sharpe: That on Tuesday 25 October 2011 the Special Minister of State portfolio be examined for the first half of the hearing and the Central Coast portfolio for the second half.

Mr Ajaka moved: That

- On Tuesday 25 October 2011 the Transport portfolio be examined as follows:
 - 2.00-3.15 Transport
 - 3.15-4.15 Rail
 - 4.15-4.30 Break
 - 4.30-5.15 Ferries
 - 5.15-6.00 State Transit
- That the Chair request that the witnesses from the various transport agencies make themselves available for the entire hearing.

Question put

The committee divided

Ayes: Mr Ajaka, Mrs Maclaren-Jones, Mr Blair, Mr Green

Noes: Mr Veitch, Ms Sharpe, Ms Faehrmann

Question resolved in the affirmative.

Resolved on the motion of Mr Ajaka: That on Friday 28 October 2011 the Tourism, Major Events, Hospitality and Racing portfolios be examined as follows:

- 9.00 - 10.00 Tourism
- 10.00 - 10.45 Arts
- 10.45-11.00 Break
- 11.00 - 12.00 Major Events
- 12.00 -1.00 Hospitality and Racing

Resolved, on the motion of Ms Faehrmann: That for the examination of the Roads and Ports portfolios on Friday 28 October 2011, the Government not use its allocated time for questioning, and the portfolios be examined as follows:

- 2.00 - 4.00 Roads
- 4.00 - 4.15 break
- 4.15 - 5.15 Ports.

Resolved, on the motion of Ms Sharpe: That

- The Minister advise the Committee of the names of any witnesses due to appear at the hearing to consider the portfolios of Central Coast and Special Minister of State, by 9am on Monday 24 October 2011.
- That the Minister advise the Committee if he does not intend to be accompanied by any additional witnesses at the hearing to consider the portfolios of Central Coast and Special Minister of State, by 9am on Monday 24 October 2011.

Ms Sharpe moved: That the Committee notes that the Government has not agreed to provide all of the witnesses requested by members to appear at GPSC3 hearings, and is disappointed at the Government's unwillingness to provide these witnesses.

Question put

The committee divided

Ayes: Mr Veitch, Ms Sharpe, Ms Faehrmann

Noes: Mr Ajaka, Mrs Maclaren-Jones, Mr Blair, Mr Green.

Question resolved in the negative.

5. ***

6. **Next meeting**

The Committee adjourned at 1.45pm until Tuesday 25 October, Budget Estimates 2011-2012, (*Regional Infrastructure and Services, 9am, Macquarie Room.*)

Beverly Duffy

Clerk to the Committee

Minutes No 4

Tuesday 25 October 2011

General Purpose Standing Committee No 3

Macquarie Room, Parliament House, Sydney, at 8.55 am

1. Members present

Mrs Maclaren-Jones (*Chair*) (at 9.12am)

Mr Blair (*Deputy Chair*)

Mr Ajaka

Ms Sharpe

Mr Veitch

Mr Buckingham (*Ms Faehrmann*)

2. Apologies

Mr Green

3. Deputy Chair

In the absence of the Chair, the Deputy Chair took the Chair, for the purposes of the meeting and until 9.12am.

4. Substitute members

The Acting Chair advised that the following member would be substituting for the hearing:

- Mr Buckingham for Ms Faehrmann.

5. Correspondence

The Committee noted the following items of correspondence:

Received:

- 18 October 2011 – From the Hon Amanda Fazio MLC to the Secretariat, advising of the Opposition's request for witnesses to appear at the 2011-2012 Budget Estimates hearings.
- 19 October 2011 – From the Special Minister of State and Minister for the Central Coast regarding the Opposition's request for witnesses to appear at the 2011-2012 Budget Estimates hearings.
- 19 October 2011– From the Minister for Tourism, Major Events, Hospitality and Racing and Minister for Arts regarding the Opposition's request for witnesses to appear at the 2011-2012 Budget Estimates hearings.
- 19 October 2011– From the Minister for Transport regarding the Opposition's request for witnesses to appear at the 2011-2012 Budget Estimates hearings.
- 19 October 2011– From the Minister for Regional Infrastructure and Services regarding the Opposition's request for witnesses to appear at the 2011-2012 Budget Estimates hearings.
- 19 October 2011– From the Minister for Roads and Ports regarding the Opposition's request for witnesses to appear at the 2011-2012 Budget Estimates hearings.

Sent:

- 30 August 2011 – From Clerk Assistant, Committees to Minister Stoner, Minister for Regional Infrastructure and Services, regarding the Minister's scheduled appearance at the Inquiry into the Budget Estimates 2011-2012
- 30 August 2011 – From Clerk Assistant, Committees to President Harwin, President of the Legislative Council of NSW, regarding the President's scheduled appearance at the Inquiry into the Budget Estimates 2011-2012
- 30 August 2011 – From Clerk Assistant, Committees to Minister Hartcher, Special Minister of State and Minister for the Central Coast, regarding the Minister's scheduled appearance at the Inquiry into the Budget Estimates 2011-2012

- 30 August 2011 – From Clerk Assistant, Committees to Minister Berejiklian, Minister for Transport, regarding the Minister’s scheduled appearance at the Inquiry into the Budget Estimates 2011-2012
- 30 August 2011 – From Clerk Assistant, Committees to Minister Souris, Minister for Tourism, Major Events, Hospitality and Racing and Arts, regarding the Minister’s scheduled appearance at the Inquiry into the Budget Estimates 2011-2012
- 30 August 2011 – From Clerk Assistant, Committees to Minister Gay, Minister for Roads and Ports, regarding the Minister’s scheduled appearance at the Inquiry into the Budget Estimates 2011-2012

6. Public hearing: Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2011-2012 – Regional Infrastructure and Services

Witnesses, the public and media were admitted.

The Acting Chair made an opening statement regarding the broadcasting of proceedings and other matters. The Acting Chair reminded Minister Stoner that he did not need to be sworn, as he had sworn an oath to his office as a member of Parliament.

The following officials from departments, statutory bodies or corporations were sworn:

- Mr Mark Paterson AO, Director General, Department of Trade and Investment, Regional Infrastructure and Services
- Mr Barry Buffier, Deputy Director General, Department of State & Regional Development and Tourism
- Mr Michael Cullen, Executive Director, Enterprise, Small Business and Regional Development.

The Acting Chair then declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio of Regional Infrastructure and Services open for examination.

The Minister and the departmental witnesses were examined by the Committee.

Mrs Maclaren-Jones joined the meeting.

The witnesses, the public and media withdrew.

The Committee deliberated

Question put: That the Committee dissent from the ruling of the Chair.

The Committee divided.

Ayes: Mr Buckingham, Ms Sharpe, Mr Veitch

Noes: Mr Ajaka, Mr Blair, Mrs Maclaren-Jones.

Question resolved in the negative on the casting vote of the Chair.

The witnesses, the public and media were readmitted.

The evidence concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

The public hearing concluded at 10.45 am.

The public and media withdrew.

7. Deliberative meeting

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Veitch: That the Committee hold a further meeting to deliberate on supplementary hearings relating to the portfolio of Regional Infrastructure and Services on a date to be determined following receipt of answers to questions on notice.

8. Adjournment

The Committee adjourned at 10.50 am until Tuesday 25 October 2011, at 11.10 am.

Cathryn Cummins
Clerk to the Committee

Minutes No 5

Tuesday 25 October 2011
General Purpose Standing Committee No 3
Macquarie Room, Parliament House, Sydney, at 11.14 am

1. Members present

Mrs Maclaren-Jones (Chair)
Mr Ajaka
Ms Fazio (*Sharpe*)
Mr Lynn (*Blair*)
Mr Primrose (*Veitch*)
Mr Shoebridge (*Faehrmann*)

2. Apologies

Mr Green

3. Substitute members

The Chair advised that the following members would be substituting for the hearing:

- Ms Fazio for Ms Sharpe
- Mr Lynn for Mr Blair
- Mr Primrose for Mr Veitch
- Mr Shoebridge for Ms Faehrmann.

4. Public hearing: Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2011-2012 – The Legislature

Witnesses, the public and media were admitted.

The Chair made an opening statement regarding the broadcasting of proceedings and other matters. The Chair reminded the President that he did not need to be sworn, as he had sworn an oath to his office as a member of Parliament.

The following officials from departments, statutory bodies or corporations were sworn:

- Mr David Blunt, Clerk of the Parliaments, NSW Legislative Council
- Mr Robert Stefanic, Executive Manager, Department of Parliamentary Services
- Mr Kim Smith, Director, Finance, Department of Parliamentary Services.

The Chair then declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio of the Legislature open for examination.

The President and the departmental witnesses were examined by the Committee.

The evidence concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

The public hearing concluded at 12.05 pm.

The public and media withdrew.

5. Deliberative meeting

Resolved, on the motion of Ms Fazio: That Hansard include the concluding paragraphs of the President's statement regarding the Twinning Program into the transcript of proceedings.

Resolved, on the motion of Ms Fazio: That the Committee hold a further meeting to deliberate on supplementary hearings relating to the Legislature portfolio on a date to be determined following receipt of answers to questions on notice.

6. Adjournment

The Committee adjourned at 12.10 pm until Tuesday 25 October 2011, at 12.10 pm.

Beverly Duffy

Clerk to the Committee

Minutes No. 6

Tuesday 25 October 2011

General Purpose Standing Committee No. 3

Macquarie Room, Parliament House, Sydney, at 12.10 pm

1. Members present

Mrs Maclaren-Jones (*Chair*)

Mr Ajaka

Ms Fazio (*Sharpe*)

Mr Lynn (*Blair*)

Mr Shoebridge (*Faehrmann*)

Mr Whan (*Veitch*)

2. Apologies

Mr Green

3. Substitute members

The Chair advised that the following members would be substituting for the hearing:

- Ms Fazio for Ms Sharpe
- Mr Lynn for Mr Blair
- Mr Shoebridge for Ms Faehrmann
- Mr Whan for Mr Veitch.

4. Deliberative meeting

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Shoebridge: That for the Budget Estimates hearing for the portfolios of Special Minister of State and the Central Coast, both portfolios be examined at the same time.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Ajaka: That during the Budget Estimates hearing for the portfolios of Special Minister of State and the Central Coast, any time for questions not used by the Government not be allocated to the Opposition or Cross Bench.

5. Public hearing: Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2011-2012 – Special Minister of State, the Central Coast

The public and media were admitted.

The Chair made an opening statement regarding the broadcasting of proceedings and other matters. The Chair reminded Minister Hartcher that he did not need to be sworn, as he had sworn an oath to his office as a member of Parliament.

The Chair then declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolios of the Special Minister of State and the Central Coast open for examination.

The Minister was examined by the Committee

The evidence concluded.

The public hearing concluded at 12.55 pm.

The public and media withdrew.

6. Deliberative meeting

Ms Fazio moved: That the Committee note that the Special Minister of State and the Minister for the Central Coast was dismissive and evasive in his answers at Budget Estimates hearing of General Purpose Standing Committee No. 3 on 25 October 2011 and demonstrated a lack of commitment to the openness and transparency which was promised by the O'Farrell Government.

Question put.

The Committee divided.

Ayes: Ms Fazio, Mr Whan, Mr Shoebridge.

Noes: Mr Ajaka, Mr Lynn, Mrs Maclaren-Jones.

Question resolved in the negative on the casting vote of the Chair.

Resolved, on the motion of Ms Fazio: That the Committee hold a further meeting to deliberate on supplementary hearings relating to the portfolios of the Special Minister of State and the Central Coast on a date to be determined following receipt of answers to questions on notice.

7. Adjournment

The Committee adjourned at 1.00 pm until Tuesday 25 October 2011, at 1.50 pm (*Transport*).

Merrin Thompson

Clerk to the Committee

Minutes No 7

Tuesday 25 October 2011

General Purpose Standing Committee No 3

Macquarie Room, Parliament House, Sydney, at 2.00 pm

1. Members present

Mrs Maclaren-Jones (*Chair*)

Mr Blair (*Deputy Chair*)

Mr Ajaka

Ms Faehrmann

Ms Fazio (*Sharpe*)

Mr Donnelly (*Veitch*).

Ms Sharpe (*participating*)

2. Apologies

Mr Green.

3. Substitute members

The Chair advised that the following members would be substituting for the purposes of this hearing:

- Mr Donnelly for Mr Veitch
- Ms Fazio for Ms Sharpe.

4. Participating members

The Chair advised that Ms Sharpe would be attending the meeting as a participating member.

5. Public hearing: Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2011-2012 – Transport

Witnesses, the public and media were admitted.

The Chair made an opening statement regarding the broadcasting of proceedings and other matters. The Chair reminded Minister Berejiklian that she did not need to be sworn, as she had sworn an oath to her office as a Member of Parliament.

The following officials from departments, statutory bodies or corporations were sworn:

- Mr Rob Mason, Chief Executive, Railcorp
- Mr Les Wielinga, Director-General, Transport NSW
- Mr Chris Lock, Deputy Director, Transport Construction Authority
- Mr Peter Rowley, Chief Executive, State Transit Authority
- Mr David Callahan, Chief Executive, Sydney Ferries.

The Chair then declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio of Transport open for examination.

The Minister and the departmental witnesses were examined by the Committee.

The evidence concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

The public hearing concluded at 5.47 pm.

The public and media withdrew.

6. Deliberative meeting

Resolved, on the motion of Ms Fazio: That the Committee hold a further meeting to deliberate on supplementary hearings relating to the portfolio of Transport on a date to be determined following receipt of answers to questions on notice.

7. Adjournment

The Committee adjourned at 5.49 pm until Friday 28 October 2011, at 8.50 am.

Stewart Smith

Clerk to the Committee

Minutes No 8

Friday 28 October 2011

General Purpose Standing Committee No 3

Jubilee Room, Parliament House, Sydney, at 8.55 am

1. Members present

Mrs Maclaren-Jones (*Chair*)

Mr Blair (*Deputy Chair*)

Mr Ajaka

Ms Barham (*Ms Faehrmann*)

Mr Green

Dr Kaye (*Ms Faehrmann*)

Ms Voltz (*Ms Sharpe*)

Mr Whan (*Mr Veitch*)

1. Substitute members

The Chair advised that the following members would be substituting for the purposes of this hearing:

- Ms Barham to substitute for Ms Faehrmann (*Tourism and Arts portfolios*)
- Dr Kaye to substitute for Ms Faehrmann (*Major Events and Hospitality and Racing portfolios*)
- Ms Voltz to substitute for Ms Sharpe
- Mr Whan to substitute for Mr Veitch.

2. Public hearing: Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2011-2012 – Tourism, Major Events, Hospitality and Racing, Arts

Witnesses, the public and media were admitted.

The Chair made an opening statement regarding the broadcasting of proceedings and other matters. The Chair reminded Minister Souris that he did not need to be sworn, as he had sworn an oath to his office as a member of Parliament.

The Chair also reminded Mr Buffier, Deputy Director General, Department of Trade & Investment, Regional Infrastructure & Services, that he did not need to be sworn, as he had been sworn at another Budget Estimates hearing.

The following officials from departments, statutory bodies or corporations were sworn:

- Ms Sandra Chipchase, Chief Executive Officer, Destination NSW
- Ms Elizabeth Tydd, Executive Director, Office of Liquor, Gaming and Racing, Department of Trade & Investment, Regional Infrastructure and Services
- Ms Mary Darwell, Executive Director, Arts NSW, Department of Trade & Investment, Regional Infrastructure and Services.

The Chair then declared the proposed expenditure for the Tourism portfolio open for examination.

The Minister and the departmental witnesses were examined by the Committee.

The evidence concluded.

The Chair then declared the proposed expenditure for the Arts portfolio open for examination.

The Minister and the departmental witnesses were examined by the Committee.

The evidence concluded.

The Chair then declared the proposed expenditure for the Major Events portfolio open for examination.

The Minister and the departmental witnesses were examined by the Committee.

The evidence concluded.

The Chair then declared the proposed expenditure for the Hospitality and Racing portfolio open for examination.

The Minister and the departmental witnesses were examined by the Committee.

The evidence concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

The public hearing concluded at 12.54 pm.

The public and media withdrew.

3. Deliberative meeting

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Ajaka: That the Committee hold a further meeting to deliberate on supplementary hearings relating to the portfolio of Tourism, Major Events, Hospitality and Racing on a date to be determined following receipt of answers to questions on notice.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Ajaka: That the Committee hold a further meeting to deliberate on supplementary hearings relating to the Arts portfolio on a date to be determined following receipt of answers to questions on notice.

4. Adjournment

The Committee adjourned at 12.56 pm until Friday 28 October 2011, at 1.50 pm.

Jenelle Moore

Clerk to the Committee

Minutes No 9

Friday 28 October 2011

General Purpose Standing Committee No 3

Macquarie Room, Parliament House, Sydney, at 1.50 pm

1. Members present

Mrs Maclaren-Jones (*Chair*)

Mr Blair (*Deputy Chair*)

Mr Ajaka

Mr Brown (*Green*)

Ms Fazio (*Sharpe*)

Dr Kaye (*Faehrmann*)

Ms Sharpe

Mr Veitch

2. Substitute members

The Chair advised that the following members would be substituting for the hearing:

- Mr Brown for Mr Green
- Ms Fazio for Ms Sharpe
- Dr Kaye for Ms Faehrmann.

3. Participating members

The Chair advised that Ms Sharpe would be attending the hearing as a participating member.

4. Conduct of hearing

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Ajaka: That the sequence of questions to be asked during the Roads and Ports portfolios alternate between Opposition and Cross Bench, in that order, with 30 minutes allocated to each.

5. Public hearing: Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2011-2012 – Roads and Ports

Witnesses, the public and media were admitted.

The Chair made an opening statement regarding the broadcasting of proceedings and other matters. The Chair reminded Minister Gay that he did not need to be sworn, as he had sworn an oath to his office as a member of Parliament.

The Chair advised that Mr Les Wielinga, Director General of Transport, did not need to be sworn, as he had been sworn in at a previous Budget Estimates hearing.

The following officials from the Roads and Traffic Authority, Department of Transport, were sworn:

- Mr Paul Hesford, Director, Finance and Corporate Services
- Ms Ann King, Deputy Chief Executive Officer and Director, Customer Services
- Mr Peter Wells, Director, Regulatory Services
- Mr Geoff Fogarty, Director, Infrastructure Services
- Mr Michael Veysey, Director, Network Services
- Dr Soames Job, Director, Centre for Road Safety.

The Chair then declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio of Roads open for examination.

The Minister and the departmental witnesses were examined by the Committee.

Dr Kaye arrived at 2.07pm.

Ms Fazio left at 2.35pm.

The evidence concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

The following officials from the Department of Transport were sworn:

- Mr Tony Middleton, Deputy Chief Executive, NSW Maritime
- Mr Grant Gilfillan, Chief Executive Officer, Sydney Ports Corporation
- Mr Dom Figliomeni, Chief Executive Officer, Port Kembla Ports Corporation.

The Chair then declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio of Ports open for examination.

The Minister and the departmental witnesses were examined by the Committee.

The evidence concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

The public hearing concluded at 5.00 pm.

The public and media withdrew.

6. Deliberative meeting

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Blair: That the Committee hold a further meeting to deliberate on supplementary hearings relating to the portfolios of Roads and Ports on a date to be determined following receipt of answers to questions on notice.

7. Adjournment

The Committee adjourned at 5.10 pm *sine die*.

Teresa McMichael

Clerk to the Committee

Minutes No. 12

Thursday 24 November 2011

General Purpose Standing Committee No. 3

Macquarie Room, Parliament House, Sydney, at 5.43pm

1. Members present

Mrs Maclaren-Jones (*Chair*)

Mr Blair (*Deputy Chair*)

Mr Ajaka

Ms Faehrmann

Ms Sharpe

Mr Veitch

Mr Green

2. Confirmation of previous minutes

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Green: That draft Minutes No.11 be confirmed.

3. Correspondence

The Committee noted the following items of correspondence received:

- 17 November 2011 – From the President to the Chair, regarding answers to questions on notice for the Budget Estimates portfolio of The Legislature.
- 18 November 2011 – From Minister Stoner to the Chair, regarding answers to questions on notice for the Budget Estimates portfolio of Regional Infrastructure and Services.
- 18 November 2011 – From Minister Hartcher to the Chair, regarding answers to questions on notice for the Budget Estimates portfolios of Special Minister of State, the Central Coast.
- 18 November 2011 – From Minister Berejiklian to the Chair, regarding answers to questions on notice for the Budget Estimates portfolio of Transport.
- 23 November 2011 – From Minister Souris to the Chair, regarding answers to questions on notice for the Budget Estimates portfolios of Tourism, Major Events, Hospitality and Racing, Arts.
- 23 November 2011 – From Minister Gay to the Chair, regarding answers to questions on notice for the Budget Estimates portfolios of Roads and Ports.

4. Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2011-2012 - Supplementary hearings

Ms Sharpe moved: That the Committee hold further hearings to consider matters relating to the portfolios of Regional Infrastructure and Services; Transport; Tourism; Major Events; Hospitality and Racing and Roads and Ports.

Question put

Ayes: Ms Sharpe, Mr Veitch, Ms Faehrmann

Noes: Mrs Maclaren-Jones; Mr Blair, Mr Ajaka, Mr Green

Question resolved in the negative

Mr Blair moved: That the Committee hold no further hearings to consider matters relating to the portfolios of the Arts, the Legislature; Special Minister of State and the Central Coast.

Question put

Ayes: Mrs Maclaren-Jones; Mr Blair, Mr Ajaka, Mr Green

Noes: Ms Sharpe, Mr Veitch, Ms Faehrmann.

Question resolved in the affirmative.

5. *****6. Adjournment**

The Committee adjourned at 5.50pm, until Tuesday 6 December 2011.

Beverly Duffy

Clerk to the Committee

Draft Minutes No. 13

Tuesday 6 December 2011

General Purpose Standing Committee No. 3

Macquarie Room, Parliament House, Sydney, at 8.57 am

1. Members present

Mrs Maclaren-Jones (*Chair*)

Mr Blair (*Deputy Chair*)

Mr Ajaka

Ms Faehrmann

Ms Sharpe

Ms Fazio (Veitch)

Mr Green

2. Substitutions

Ms Fazio for Mr Veitch.

3. Confirmation of previous minutes

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Ajaka: That draft Minutes No.12 be confirmed.

4. *****5. Budget Estimates 2011-2012: Chair's draft report**

The Chair submitted her draft report entitled *Budget Estimates 2011–2012*, which, having been previously circulated, was taken as being read.

Ms Sharpe moved: That the following words be inserted after paragraph 1.6: ‘The Committee was disappointed not to have had a second opportunity to re-examine the portfolios of Regional Infrastructure and Services; Transport; Tourism; Major Events; Hospitality and Racing and Roads and Ports.’

Question put.

The Committee divided.

Ayes: Ms Faehrmann, Ms Fazio, Ms Sharpe

Noes: Mr Ajaka, Mr Blair, Mr Green, Mrs Maclaren-Jones.

Question resolved in the negative.

Ms Sharpe indicated her intention to submit a dissenting statement.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Blair: That dissenting statements be submitted to the Secretariat by 5.00pm on Wednesday 7 December 2011.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Blair:

- That the report be the report of the Committee.
- That the Committee present the report to the Clerk of the Parliaments, together with transcripts of evidence, answers to questions on notice, minutes of proceedings and correspondence relating to the Inquiry.

6. **Adjournment**

The Committee adjourned at 5.20 pm *sine die*.

Beverly Duffy

Clerk to the Committee

Appendix 3 Dissenting statement

Dissenting report from Hon Penny Sharpe MLC and Hon Mick Veitch MLC

The Budget Estimates process for General Purpose Standing Committee Number 3 was the first time hearings have been held for the 55th Parliament.

The change of government has brought with it changes to the operation of GPSC 3 in the following ways:

- While the Government has previously held the chair of GPSC3, it was disappointing that Government members with the support of the Christian Democrat Party member took the chair of the committee.
- The Government members with the support of the Christian Democrat member combined to ensure that there was no call back of Ministers or public servants in several portfolios.

The Opposition members of GPSC 3 sought to have a call back for the following portfolios:

- Regional Infrastructure and Services
- Transport
- Tourism
- Major Events
- Hospitality and Racing
- Roads and Ports

The role of the Budget Estimates process is outlined on the Parliament website:

Each year Government ministers and senior public servants attend an annual Budget Estimates inquiry to answer questions about the expenditure, performance and effectiveness of their departments.

Budget Estimates is a key process for government accountability and transparency. The Budget Estimates inquiries involve hours of detailed questioning by members of the Legislative Council on the decisions, actions and advice of ministers and public servants.

The Opposition members believe that given the limitations of GPSC 3 imposed on the committee by Government members with the support of the Christian Democrat member that this role has been curtailed.